

Hinduism Here

Religion GU4215
Barnard College, Columbia University
Wednesdays 4:10-6:00, 101 Claremont, Fall 2019

Jack Hawley
Milbank 219a
jsh3@columbia.edu, 212-854-5292
Office hours: Thursdays 4-6 and by appointment



Course Description: This course explores the diversity of “lived Hinduism” in the greater New York area—its historical, theological, social, and ritual dimensions. Individual field projects focus on worshipping communities, yoga centers, and other Hindu-related social forms such as community associations, retreat centers, or parades and processions.

Course Rationale: It is often argued that in the last half century, Hindus living outside of India have come to exert an influence on Hinduism generally that is far more creative and influential than their sheer numbers would predict. This course enables students to investigate that phenomenon while simultaneously getting a sense of how disparate—yet interconnected—are the environments where such rethinking and “repracticing” take place in the greater New York area. The question of whether this is “re”-anything arises: Is American Hinduism increasingly its own home-grown thing? The course provides a framework in which students work individually to investigate and document some aspect of “Hinduism Here” by means of interviews, participant observation, life histories, and/or archival research. They report some of these findings, as appropriate, to the course website, a cumulative project begun in 2003 when the course was first offered: <https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3/>.

Course Requirements:

(a) *Reading and class participation.* Students are expected to attend all class sessions, and to participate vigorously in class discussion on the basis of a thoughtful reading of the assigned materials.

(b) *Weekly reading responses.* Short weekly postings in response to our common readings must be made to Courseworks in weeks 2-10. These are due at 5:00 p.m. each Tuesday on the discussion board as MSWord attachments—a maximum of 500 words. Please double-space. One weekly posting may be omitted without a penalty.

(c) *Seminar projects.* Starting early in the course, students spend significant time and effort relating their readings to the study of one particular site, which serves as the basis of the seminar paper each will produce (ca. 15 pages). Writing relevant to these individual seminar projects will be presented in the following stages:

- 1- First-run paper on your site, 5 pages (October 18)
- 2- Draft seminar paper, ca. 15 pages (Friday 11/8 or 11/15)
- 3- Website profile, ca. 750 words plus images (November 27)
- 4- Final seminar paper, ca. 15 pages (December 9).

The Website profile and the seminar paper are separate documents—the one publicly accessible and the other confidential within the class. The two may, however, be related. Some students may decide that, after an introduction, the Website profile will form an early part of the seminar paper, which then goes on in a more strictly analytic vein and with enrichment provided by what has been learned in interviews and by other means. Other students may decide that the Web profile and the internal seminar paper are best conceived of as distinct entities. The Web profile will address a template of questions we will develop as a class early in the term. Of course, this need not mean that one size fits all.

Evaluation system:

Reading responses	25%
Class participation	15%
“First run” analytical paper 10/18	15%
Website profile 11/27	15%
Final seminar paper 12/9	30%

Late work:

Except in case of serious medical or family emergencies, late work will be downgraded one-half letter grade per day.

Course Readings:

(1) *Books.* The following books are required for the course, and are available for purchase at BookCulture (536 W. 112th Street). Copies are also available on reserve at the Barnard College Library, and in several instances available in electronic form at no cost to students. These are annotated as CLIO.

Robert M. Emerson, Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw, *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995).

Andrea R. Jain, *Selling Yoga: For Counterculture to Pop Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015). CLIO.

Lola Williamson, *Transcendent in America: Hindu-Inspired Meditation Movements as New Religion* (New York: New York University Press, 2010). CLIO.

(2) *Required reading.* Available online or as e-reserves or in “files & resources” on Courseworks. These are indicated on the course syllabus with a single asterisk (*).

(3) *Additional resources.* Readings that may be helpful but are not required are listed with other readings for the weeks to which they most closely pertain. Many are also available on Courseworks. They are indicated with a double asterisk (**).

Selected Digital Resources:

<https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3/>

<http://www.nycreligion.info>

<http://www.archive-it.org/collections/1945>

www.pluralism.org

www.asiasource.org/news

www.indiaabroad.com

www.hinduismtoday.com

www.samachar.com

www.columbia.edu/cu/lweb/indiv/southasia/cuvl

<https://thewire.in/>

COURSE SYLLABUS

Week 1: September 4. Introduction to the course and to a series of sites on which individual class projects might focus.

- * Courtney Bender et al., “Field Research: The Basics”

Week 2: September 11. Hinduism in America and in New York

* Diana L. Eck, *A New Religious America* (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 2001), pp. 80-141.

* <https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3>. Read through “Research Sites.”

- * <http://www.pluralism.org>. Survey the sites listed under Hinduism.

* J. S. Hawley, “Global Hinduism in Gotham,” in Tony Carnes and Fenggang Yang, eds., *Asian American Religions: The Making and Remaking of Borders and Boundaries* (New York: New York University Press, 2004), pp. 112-137.

** Prema A. Kurien, *A Place at the Multicultural Table* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2007), chapters 3-5 (on “Popular Hinduism”), pp. 40-116.

Week 3: Sunday, September 15. FIELD TRIP. South Asia in Flushing.

* R. Scott Hanson, *City of Gods: Religious Freedom, Immigration, and Pluralism in Flushing, Queens* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2016), chapter 3, pp. 89-150. CLIO.

* Anon., *Significance of the Rituals* (New York: The Hindu Temple Society of North America, 2008).

** Hanna Kim, “The BAPS Swaminarayan Temple Organization and its Publics,” in Zavos et al., eds., *Public Hinduisms* (New Delhi and Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012), pp. 417-439.

** Joyce Burkhalter Flueckiger, *Everyday Hinduism* (Malden, MA: Wiley Blackwell, 2015), pp. 1-12, 73-109. CLIO.

This week's posting, due at the regular time on Tuesday, Sept. 17, takes the form of your unredacted jottings our visit to the Maha Vallabha Ganapati Devasthanam temple together with a 500-word field note related to those jottings. NB: There is no class on Wednesday, Sept. 18. I have to be away.

Week 4: September 25. Doing Fieldwork. Your course project.

* Scout out your course project. This will form the basis for your posting this week. Devote 500 words to describing the project site and anticipating how you would like to study it. Supply relevant bibliography to the extent possible—materials you have already consulted or think might be helpful as you proceed.

* Robert M. Emerson, Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw, *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), pp. 1-65. The remaining chapters of this book are a helpful resources throughout the course.

* Sunil Bhatia, *American Karma: Race, Culture, and Identity in the Indian Diaspora* (New York: New York University Press, 2007), chapter 2 (“Qualitative Inquiry and Psychology: Doing Ethnography in Transnational Cultures”), pp. 42-73. CLIO.

* Complete the Human Subjects Research training program available at <https://www.rascal.columbia.edu>. Select Training Center > Course Listings > TC0087 > Take Course > <http://www.citiprogram.org>. This on-line course is intended to take one hour to complete and, once done, provides you the certification necessary to proceed with our course.

** John Zavos et al., *Public Hinduisms*, posted on Courseworks: Files & Resources. Especially Shana Sippy, “Will the Real Mango Please Stand Up? Reflections on Defending Dharma and Historicizing Hinduism,” pp. 22-44.

Week 5: October 2. Four Case Studies

* Vasudha Narayanan, “Hinduism in Pittsburgh: Creating the South Indian “Hindu” Experience in the United States,” in John Stratton Hawley and Vasudha Narayanan, eds., *The Life of Hinduism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), pp. 231-248; originally published in Raymond B. Williams, ed., *A Sacred Thread: Modern Transmission of Hindu Traditions in India and Abroad* (Chambersburg, PA: Anima Publications, 1992), pp. 147-176. CLIO.

* <https://www.svtemple.org/Home.aspx>.

* Joanne Punzo Waghorne, “The Hindu Gods in a Split-Level World: The Sri Siva-Vishnu Temple in Suburban Washington, D.C.,” in Robert A. Orsi, ed., *Gods of the City* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999), pp. 105-130. CLIO.

* <https://www.ssvt.org/>

* Corinne G. Dempsey, “Women, Ritual, and the Ironies of Power at a North American Goddess Temple,” in Linda Penkower and Tracy Pintchman, eds., *Hindu Ritual at the Margins: Transformations, Innovations, Reconsiderations* (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2014), pp. 106-125. CLIO.

* https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_2BqaWYk0UE

* Shana L. Sippy, “Desiring Acceptance: The Practice of Strategic Citizenship and Modeling Moral Virtue in the Wake of Divine Desecration” (on Maple Grove, Minnesota), which is chapter 8 of “Diasporic Desires: Making Hindus and the Cultivation of Longing” (PhD. Dissertation, Columbia University, 2018), pp. 374-404. Available independently on Courseworks.

* <https://www.hindumandirmn.org/>

** Lindsey Harlan, “Reversing the Gaze in America: Parody in Divali Performance at Connecticut College,” in Knut A. Jacobsen and P. Pratap Kumar, eds., *South Asians in the Diaspora* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2004), pp. 161-179.

** Wendy Cadge, “De Facto Congregationalism and the Religious Organizations of Post-1965 Immigrants to the United States: A Revised Approach,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 76:2 (2008), pp. 344-374. CLIO.

Week 6. October 9. Caribbean Hindus in New York

Special Guest: Gaurika Mehta

* Steven Vertovec, *The Hindu Diaspora: Comparative Patterns* (London: Routledge, 2000), chapters 2 (on Caribbean history) and 7 (on “Three Meanings of Diaspora”), pp. 39-62, 141-160.

* Keith E. McNeal, “Doing the Mother’s Caribbean Work: On *Shakti* and Society in Contemporary Trinidad,” in Rachel Fell McDermott and Jeffrey Kripal, eds., *Encountering Kālī: In the Margins, at the Center, in the West* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003), pp. 223-248. CLIO.

* Gaurika Mehta, “Temple Multilingualism.” Unpublished paper, Columbia University, December, 2017.

* <http://kalidevimandir.com/>

* Drew Thomases and James D. Reich, “Therapy Across the Line: Goddess ‘Manifestation’ in an Indo-Caribbean Hindu Temple in Brooklyn,” *The Revealer*, April 5, 2017. <https://therevealer.org/therapy-across-the-line-goddess-manifestation-in-an-indo-caribbean-hindu-temple-in-brooklyn/>.

* Drew Thomases and James D. Reich, “‘Out-of-the-Box’ Hinduism: Double Diaspora and the Guyanese Hindus of Queens, NY,” *Journal of Hindu Studies*: <https://academic.oup.com/jhs/advancearticle/doi/10.1093/jhs/hiy023/5258925?>

** John Strasser, “Shri Surya Narayan Mandir” (2013). <https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3/shri-surya-narayan-mandir/>

** Jamie Burke and Alvino Sarran on the America Sevashram Sangha” (2003), <https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3/america-sevashrama-sangha/>

** Prita Lal, “Arya Spiritual Center” (2005), <https://edblogs.columbia.edu/reliw4215-001-2013-3/arya-spiritual-center/>

** Michele M. Verma, “Indo-Caribbean Hindu Practice in Queens: Ethnomethods of Constituting Place, Practice, and Subjects,” Ph.D. Dissertation, Columbia University Teachers College, 2008, chapters 2-3, pp. 80-141.

** Aisha Khan, *Callaloo Nation: Metaphors of Rice and Religious Identity among South Asians in Trinidad* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004). CLIO.

Week 7. October 16. Memory, Distance, Mediation—the Swaminarayan Sampraday

Special Guest: Yogi Trivedi

* <https://www.baps.org/Global-Network/North-America/Robbinsville.aspx>

* Swami Paramtattvadas, “Akshar-Purushottam School of Vedanta,” *Hinduism Today* Oct.-Dec. 2019, pp. 36-51.

* Hanna Kim, “Thinking through Akshardham and the Making of the Swaminarayan Self,” in Raymond Brady Williams and Yogi Trivedi, eds., *Swaminarayan Hinduism: Tradition, Adaptation, and Identity* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 383-401. CLIO.

* Andrew Kunze, Swaminarayan (BAPS) Identity Formation in Virtual Transnationalism,” in Raymond Brady Williams and Yogi Trivedi, eds., *Swaminarayan Hinduism: Tradition, Adaptation, and Identity* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 402-417. CLIO.

* Paul Connerton, *How Societies Remember* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), Chapter 2 (“Commemorative Ceremonies”), pp. 41-71. CLIO.

* Elizabeth Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory: Early Christian Culture Making* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), pp. 10-32.

** Maurice Halbwachs, “Religious Collective Memory,” which is part I, chapter 6 of Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory*, tr. Lewis A. Coser (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), pp. 84-119.

Friday, October 18. A five-page, double-spaced descriptive and analytical paper on your project site is due on Courseworks/Discussions by midnight.

Week 8. October 23. Gurus and Shishyas

* Lola Williamson, *Transcendent in America: Hindu-Inspired Meditation Movements as New Religion* (New York: New York University Press, 2010), Preface and Chapter 1 (ix-25), Chapter 5 (pp. 106-131, on Siddha Yoga), and Chapter 6 (135-160) on the guru-disciple relationship. CLIO.

* <https://www.siddhayoganyc.org>.

Compare Amritanandamayi Ma (or Ammachi):

* <https://amma.org/>

* <https://amma.org/meeting-amma/north-america/new-york>

* <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wMdyh-PzGac>

** Karen Pechilis, ed., *The Graceful Guru: Hindu Female Gurus in India and the United States* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004).

** Thomas A. Foersthofel and Cynthia Ann Humes, eds., *Gurus in America* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2005).

** Amanda J. Lucia, *Reflections of Amma: Devotees in a Global Embrace* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014). CLIO.

** Amanda Lucia, "Guru Sex: Charisma, Proxemic Desire, and the Haptic Logics of the Guru-Disciple Relationship," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 86:4 (2018), 953-988.

Week 9. October 30. Yoga

* Andrea R. Jain, *Selling Yoga: For Counterculture to Pop Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015). CLIO.

* <https://yogavida.com>

* *Sivananda YOGALife* (Summer 2019).

* Andrew J. Nicholson, "Is Yoga Hindu?: On the Fuzziness of Religious Boundaries." *Common Knowledge* 19:3, pp. 490-505. Online.

** Mark Singleton, *Yoga Body: The Origins of Modern Posture Practice* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010).

** Stefanie Syman, *The Subtle Body: The Story of Yoga in America* (New York: Farrar, Straus, and Giroux, 2010).

** Elizabeth de Michelis, *A History of Modern Yoga: Patañjali and Western Esotericism* (London: Continuum, 2004).

** Deborah S. Bernstein and Bob Weisenberg, eds., *Yoga in America: Passion, Diversity, and Enlightenment in the Words of Some of Yoga's Most Ardent Teachers* (n.p.: Lulu.com Publishing, 2009).

Week 10. November 6. ISKCON and its Offshoots

* Gadadhara Pandit Dasa, *Urban Monk: Exploring Karma, Consciousness, and the Divine* (N.p.: Pankaj Srivastava, 2013), Chapters 9, 10, and 12.

* Nicole Karapanagiotis, “Of Digital Images and Digital Media: Approaches to Marketing in American ISKCON,” *Nova Religio* 21:3 (2018), pp. 74-102. (CLIO)

* Claire Robison, “Daiva Varṇāśrama Sharma and the Formation of Modern Vaiṣṇava Subjects in ISKCON Mumbai,” *Nidan* 28:2 (2016), pp. 69-87. (CLIO)

Friday, November 8. If you are presenting your project to the class on November 13, it is due in draft form on Courseworks/Discussions by midnight.

Week 11. November 13. Site Projects – I

This is the first of two weeks in which students will present their work. Draft versions of the project reports will provide the main reading for each of these weeks, posted to Courseworks by midnight on the Friday prior to the seminar. These will be supplemented by additional short readings that presenters may wish to assign as background relevant to their presentations. Students not making presentations will be responsible for editorial evaluations of the papers presented in any given week—probably two students commenting on a given paper.

Friday, November 15. If you are presenting your project to the class on November 20, it is due in draft form on Courseworks/Discussions by midnight.

Week 12. November 20. Site Projects – II

Week 13. November 27. No class--the American Academy of Religion and Thanksgiving get in the way. BUT the final version of your site profile, posted to the class website, is due by midnight. Probable length: 750 words and with images.

Week 14. December 4. Response and Review

The final assignment is to make a visit to a site that has been studied by another member of the seminar. These visits will form the basis for our final discussion. Then we’ll drown our sorrows over dinner at The Symposium.

Monday, December 9. The final version of your seminar paper is due at Courseworks/ Discussions.

The Sites

Any of the sites that have been studied in earlier iterations of the course are possibilities for this time around as well—or choose a new one. New Jersey and the suburbs are also fair game.

Jamaica / Richmond Hill / Ozone Park

Maha Kali Mandir, Arya Samaj Mandir, Sudama Mandir, Lakshmi Narayan Mandir, Shri Devi Mandir, Shri Trimurti Bhavan, Kali Mai churches, Rajkumari Cultural Center; fortunetellers/astrologers along Liberty Avenue

Flushing

Sai Baba Temple, Hindu Center, BAPS Swaminarayan Mandir

Woodside

Shree Guru Ravidas Temple, Divya Dham,

Elmhurst

Geeta Temple, Bangladesh Hindu Mandir

Manhattan

Art of Living NYC Center, Chinmaya Mission, AmmaNY (e.g., Namaste Healing Center), Bhakti Center, various yoga centers and Ayurvedic practitioners

Beyond

For example, the BAPS Swaminarayan Akshardham in Robbinsville, NJ; Arshya Vidya Gurukulam in Saylorsville, PA; and retreat centers such as Ananda Ashram in Monroe, NY are possibilities. These involve significant travel times, however, and the structure of your project (as in the spirit of several of these sites) would have to allow for fewer, more intensive visits.

Select Supplemental Bibliography

The debate about constructing Hinduism:

** Vasudha Dalmia and Heinrich von Stietencron, eds., *Representing Hinduism: The Construction of Religious Traditions and National Identity* (New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1995).

** J. S. Hawley, "Naming Hinduism," *The Wilson Quarterly* 15:3 (summer 1991), pp. 20-34.

** J. E. Llewellyn, ed., *Defining Hinduism: A Reader* (New York: Routledge, 2005).

** David N. Lorenzen, "Who Invented Hinduism?," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 41:4 (1999), pp. 630-359.

** Wendy Doniger, "Hinduism by Any Other Name," *The Wilson Quarterly* 15:3 (summer 1991), pp. 35-41.

** Ronald Inden, *Imagining India* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990), pp. 85-130.

** Brian K. Pennington, *Was Hinduism Invented? Britons, Indians, and the Colonial Construction of Religion* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005).

** Gunther D. Sontheimer and Hermann Kulke, eds., *Hinduism Reconsidered* (New Delhi: Manohar, 1989).

** Will Sweetman, *Mapping Hinduism: 'Hinduism' and the Study of Indian Religions, 1600-1776* (Halle: Verlag der Franckeschen Stiftungen zu Halle, 2003).

Hinduism and new immigrant religion in New York:

** Vivek Bald, *Bengali Harlem and the Lost Histories of South Asian America* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013).

** Tony Carnes and Anna Karpathakis, eds., *New York Glory: Religions in the City* (New York: New York University Press, 2001).

** Chakravorty, Sanjoy, Devesh Kapur, and Nirvikar Singh, *The Other One Percent: Indians in America* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2017).

** Madhulika S. Khandelwal, "Indian Immigration in Queens, New York City: Patterns of Spatial Concentration and Distribution, 1965-1990," in Peter van der Veer, *Nation and Migration*, pp. 178-196.

** Hanna Kim, “Being Swaminarayan: The Ontology and Significance of Belief in the Construction of a Gujarati Diaspora,” PhD. dissertation, Columbia University, 2001.

** Joanna Lessinger, *From the Ganges to the Hudson: Indian Immigrants in New York City* (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1995).

** Susan Slyomovics, “New York City’s Muslim World Day Parade,” in Peter van der Veer, ed., *Nation and Migration: The Politics of Space in the South Asian Diaspora* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995).

** Robert A. Orsi, ed., *Gods of the City* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999), especially the Introduction, pp. 1-58.

American Hinduism (beyond works cited elsewhere above)

** Michael J. Altman, *Heathen, Hindoo, Hindu: American Representations of India, 1721-1893* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017).

** Srinivas Aravamudan, *Guru English: South Asian Religion in a Cosmopolitan Language* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006).

** Corinne G. Dempsey, *The Goddess Lives in Upstate New York* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), entire, pp. 3-214.

** Philip Goldberg, *American Veda: From Emerson and the Beatles to Yoga and Meditation—How Indian Spirituality Changed the West* (New York: Three Rivers Press, 2010).

** P. Pratap Kumar, ed., *Contemporary Hinduism* (Durham: Acumen, 2013).

** Karline McLain, *The Afterlife of Sai Baba: Competing Visions of a Global Saint* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2016).

** Sunaina Marr Maira, *Desit in the House: Indian American Youth Culture in New York City* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2002).

** Vijay Prashad, *The Karma of Brown Folk* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2000).

** Padma Rangaswamy, *Namasté America: Indian Immigrants in an American Metropolis* (University Park, PA: Penn State Press, 2000).

** Aparna Rayaprol, *Negotiating Identities: Women in the Indian Diaspora* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1997).

** Mark Singleton and Ellen Goldberg, eds., *Gurus of Modern Yoga* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014).

** Sandhya Shukla, "Locations for South Asian Diasporas," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30 (2001), pp. 551-572.

** Tulasi Srinivas, *Winged Faith: Rethinking Globalization and Religious Pluralism through the Sathya Sai Movement* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010).

** Joanne Punzo Waghorne, *Diaspora of the Gods: Modern Hindu Temples in an Urban Middle-Class World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004).

On ethnography

** Corinne G. Dempsey, "Reading and Writing (to) the Devi: Reflections on Unanticipated Ritualized Ethnography." *Method and Theory in the Study of Religion* 21 (2009), pp. 28-39.

** Ron Grimes, "Fieldwork in Religious Studies: Guidelines and Forms for the Waterloo Religions Project," unpublished paper, Wilfred Laurier University, 2002, pp. 7-10, 17-24, 43-54.

** Harry F. Wolcott, *The Art of Fieldwork* (Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press, 1995), chapter 5, pp. 86-121.

** Arthur J. Magida, ed., *How to Be a Perfect Stranger: A Guide to Etiquette in Other People's Religious Ceremonies* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1996).

** James Clifford and George E. Marcus, eds., *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986). See especially the chapter by Vincent Crapanzano, "Hermes' Dilemma: The Masking of Subversion in Ethnographic Description," pp. 51-76.

** Ruth Behar and Deborah A. Gordon, eds. *Women Writing Culture* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).